



Impact on Teaching	Impact on Learning
Teachers will...	Students will...

C3 FRAMEWORK INDICATORS: GRADES 3-5

C3 INDICATORS	DESCRIPTION	APPLICATION	CONNECTIONS TO THE COMMON CORE STATE STANDARDS
<p>Gathering and Evaluating Sources</p> <p><i>Individually and with others, students...</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • D3.1.3-5. Gather relevant information from multiple sources while using the origin, structure, and context to guide the selection. • D3.2.3-5. Use distinctions among fact and opinion to determine the credibility of multiple sources. <p>Developing Claims and Using Evidence</p> <p><i>Individually and with others, students...</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • D3.3.3-5. Identify evidence that draws information from multiple sources in response to compelling questions. • D3.4.3-5. Use evidence to develop claims in response to compelling questions. 	<p>Whether students are constructing opinions, explanation, or arguments, they will gather information from a variety of sources and evaluate the relevance of that information. In this section, students are asked to work with the sources that they gather and/or are provided for them. It is important for students to use online and print sources, and they need to be mindful that not all sources are relevant to their task. They also need to understand that there are general Common Core literacy skills, such as identifying an author's purpose, main idea, and point of view, that will help in evaluating the usefulness of a source.</p> <p>This subsection focuses on argumentation. In contrast to opinions and explanations, argumentation involves the ability to understand the source-to-evidence relationship. That relationship emphasizes the development of claims and counterclaims and the purposeful selection of evidence in support of those claims and counterclaims. Students will learn to develop claims using evidence, but their initial claims will often be tentative and probing. As students delve deeper into the available sources, they construct more sophisticated claims and counterclaims that draw on evidence from multiple sources. Whether those claims are implicitly or explicitly stated in student products, they will reflect the evidence students have selected from the sources they have consulted.</p>		

Evaluating Sources & USING EVIDENCE

DIMENSION 3 INCLUDES the skills students need to analyze information and come to conclusions in an inquiry. These skills focus on gathering and evaluating sources, and then developing claims and using evidence to support those claims.

Students should use various technologies and skills to find information and to express their responses to compelling and supporting questions through well-reasoned explanations and evidence-based arguments. Through the rigorous analysis of sources and application of information from those sources, students should make the evidence-based claims that will form the basis for their conclusions.

Although Dimension 3 includes a sophisticated set of skills, even the youngest children understand the

need to give reasons for their ideas. As they progress through the grades, students learn more advanced approaches related to these skills. In the subsection Developing Claims and Using Evidence below, students generate claims and identify evidence to support those claims.

The specific skills described in Dimension 3 support the examination of content using concepts and tools from the social studies disciplines.

Gathering and Evaluating Sources

Whether students are constructing opinions, explanation, or arguments, they will gather information from a variety of sources and evaluate the relevance of that information. In this section, students are asked to work with the sources that they gather and/or are provided for them. It is important for students to use online and print sources, and they need to be mindful that not all sources are relevant to their task.

They also need to understand that there are general Common Core literacy skills, such as identifying an author's purpose, main idea, and point of view, that will help in evaluating the usefulness of a source.

Indicators of Dimension 3—Gathering and Evaluating Sources—are detailed in the suggested K-12 Pathway for College, Career, and Civic Readiness in Table 25.

**TABLE 25: Suggested K-12 Pathway for College, Career, and Civic Readiness
Dimension 3, Gathering and Evaluating Sources**

BY THE END OF GRADE 2	BY THE END OF GRADE 5	BY THE END OF GRADE 8	BY THE END OF GRADE 12
INDIVIDUALLY AND WITH OTHERS, STUDENTS...			
D3.1.K-2. Gather relevant information from one or two sources while using the origin and structure to guide the selection.	D3.1.3-5. Gather relevant information from multiple sources while using the origin, structure, and context to guide the selection.	D3.1.6-8. Gather relevant information from multiple sources while using the origin, authority, structure, context, and corroborative value of the sources to guide the selection.	D3.1.9-12. Gather relevant information from multiple sources representing a wide range of views while using the origin, authority, structure, context, and corroborative value of the sources to guide the selection.
D3.2.K-2. Evaluate a source by distinguishing between fact and opinion.	D3.2.3-5. Use distinctions among fact and opinion to determine the credibility of multiple sources.	D3.2.6-8. Evaluate the credibility of a source by determining its relevance and intended use.	D3.2.9-12. Evaluate the credibility of a source by examining how experts value the source.

Developing Claims and Using Evidence

This subsection focuses on argumentation. In contrast to opinions and explanations, argumentation involves the ability to understand the source-to-evidence relationship. That relationship emphasizes the development of claims and counterclaims and the purposeful selection of evidence in support of those claims and counterclaims. Students will learn to develop claims using evidence, but their initial claims will often be tentative and probing. As students delve deeper into the available sources, they construct more

sophisticated claims and counterclaims that draw on evidence from multiple sources. Whether those claims are implicitly or explicitly stated in student products, they will reflect the evidence students have selected from the sources they have consulted.

Indicators of Dimension 3—Developing Claims and Using Evidence—are detailed in the suggested K-12 Pathway for College, Career, and Civic Readiness in Table 26.

**TABLE 26: Suggested K-12 Pathway for College, Career, and Civic Readiness
Dimension 3, Developing Claims and Using Evidence**

BY THE END OF GRADE 2	BY THE END OF GRADE 5	BY THE END OF GRADE 8	BY THE END OF GRADE 12
INDIVIDUALLY AND WITH OTHERS, STUDENTS...			
<i>Begins in grades 3–5</i>	D3.3.3-5. Identify evidence that draws information from multiple sources in response to compelling questions.	D3.3.6-8. Identify evidence that draws information from multiple sources to support claims, noting evidentiary limitations.	D3.3.9-12. Identify evidence that draws information directly and substantively from multiple sources to detect inconsistencies in evidence in order to revise or strengthen claims.
<i>Begins in grades 3–5</i>	D3.4.3-5. Use evidence to develop claims in response to compelling questions.	D3.4.6-8. Develop claims and counterclaims while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both.	D3.4.9-12. Refine claims and counterclaims attending to precision, significance, and knowledge conveyed through the claim while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both.



ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS/LITERACY COMMON CORE CONNECTIONS: DIMENSION 3

The ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards focus broadly on evaluating sources and using evidence as skills that are fundamental to success in college and career. According to the Common Core Standards, “students need the ability to gather, comprehend, evaluate, synthesize, and report on information and ideas” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 4). Students are expected to “use relevant evidence when supporting their own points in writing and speaking, making their reasoning clear to the reader or listener, and they constructively evaluate others’ use of evidence” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 7). The ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards also make clear that these skills connect to civic life, arguing that students must “reflexively demonstrate the cogent reasoning and use of evidence that is essential to both private deliberation and responsible citizenship in a democratic republic” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 3).

Through research, students hone their ability to gather and evaluate information and then use that information as evidence in a wide range of endeavors. The ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards emphasize these skills as key to an integrated model of literacy. The C3 Framework and the Indicators in Dimension 3 apply this model to social studies inquiry.

Table 27 details connections between Dimension 3 and the College and Career Readiness Anchor Standards in the ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards. These connections are further elaborated with examples.

Connections between the C3 Framework and the College and Career Readiness Anchor Standards. While the connections between the C3 Framework and the ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards are comprehensive and consistent, seventeen CCR Anchor Standards within the ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards have broader connections within Dimension 3.

Anchor Reading Standards 1–10 are closely aligned with Dimension 3. As students gather and evaluate information, develop claims, and use evidence, they will engage with a variety of sources requiring a wide range of reading skills. During these experiences, students will need to use the full complement of skills highlighted in the Reading Standards by reading closely for meaning, while determining main ideas, details, structure, purpose, source type, and claims emitting from the sources, and comparing among multiple sources. The ten Anchor Reading Standards offer a foundation for social studies inquiry. Together, the standards offer a comprehensive picture of a skilled reader who is prepared to engage sources during the process of inquiry. For example, Reading Standard 1 requires students to “cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 10).

This skill is an important part of evaluating the credibility of a source, something that the C3 Framework calls on students to do in Dimension 3. Additionally, in Reading Standard 8, students are expected to

Table 27: Connections between Dimension 3 and the CCR Anchor Standards in the ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards

ELA/LITERACY CCR ANCHOR STANDARDS CONNECTIONS	Gathering and Evaluating Sources	Reading 1–10 Writing 1, 2, 7–10 Speaking and Listening 1
	Developing Claims and Using Evidence	
SHARED LANGUAGE		Argument; Sources; Evidence; Claims, Counterclaims; Gather

evaluate arguments and claims in a text, given the “relevance and sufficiency of the evidence” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 8). By developing these skills, students become familiar with how others use evidence and understand the importance of evidence in arguments. The C3 Framework asks students to apply these skills in the process of inquiry, so they are able to construct disciplinary explanations and arguments.

Students evaluate sources and use evidence regularly when conducting inquiry. Anchor Writing Standard 1 sets an expectation that students will use “valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence” when writing arguments (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 18). Standard 2 for writing requires students to “write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 18). Writing Standards 7-9 offer a range of specific activities that undergird student expectations for this Dimension of the C3 Framework: Writing Standard 7 focuses on “short as well as more sustained research projects based on focused questions” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 18); Writing Standard 8 calls on students to “gather relevant information” and “assess the credibility and accuracy of each source” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 18); and Writing Standard 9 asks students to draw evidence from (in this case) informational texts “to support analysis, reflection, and research” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 18). The C3 Framework extends all of these skills for the purpose of disciplinary inquiry and civic engagement.

Inquiry in social studies is an inherently collaborative activity, and thus, Anchor Speaking and Listening Standard 1 is particularly relevant in Dimension 3. Speaking and Listening Standard 1 calls on students to “prepare for and participate effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively” (NGA and CCSSO, 2010a, p. 22). The C3 Framework assumes a collaborative environment as students work through their inquiries. As students gather and evaluate sources for relevant information and determine credibility toward building claims with evidence, they should have multiple opportunities to practice civil, democratic discourse with diverse partners.

Shared Language. The ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards closely align with Indicators in Dimension 3. In places, the connections between the Common Core Standards and C3 Framework Indicators are so close that we used the same language. For example, the terms *argument*, *sources*, *evidence*, *claims*, *counterclaims*, and *gather* are used consistently in both the ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards and the C3 Framework.

It is important to note that the ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards emphasize the unique skill of argumentation in preparing students for college and career. The disciplines that make up the social studies, including the behavioral and social sciences, stress the importance of arguments, and in particular, the necessity of constructing them in ways that make use of sources and data as evidence. While in grades K–5, the ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards employ the term *opinion* to refer to a developing form of argument, the C3 Framework uses the term *argument* consistently throughout the K-12 grade bands.

The Common Core Standards use the terms *sources* and *gather* regularly with regard to locating, evaluating, making claims, and using evidence. In places, the ELA/Literacy Common Core Standards distinguish sources as print or digital, as visual, quantitative and/or textual sources, and as primary or secondary sources.

In social studies these distinctions are made manifest in spatial sources such as maps, quantitative information reflecting economic data and trends, and even physical sources such as historical artifacts. Dimension 3 explicitly references the distinction between primary and secondary sources, based on the intended use by students.

Lastly, it is important to note that Anchor Writing Standard 8 of the Common Core Standards calls attention to the issue of plagiarism and proper citation of sources—a key concern for the C3 Framework and for social studies teachers.

Student learning is enhanced by a teacher's skillful use of resources; some of these are provided by the school as "official" materials; others are secured by teachers through their own initiative. Resources fall into several different categories: those used in the classroom by students, those available beyond the classroom walls to enhance student learning, those for teachers to further their own professional knowledge and skill, and those that can provide non-instructional assistance to students. Teachers recognize the importance of discretion in the selection of resources, choosing those that align directly with the learning outcomes and that will be of most use to the students. Accomplished teachers also ensure that the selection of materials and resources is appropriately challenging for every student; texts, for example, are available at various reading levels to guarantee all students access to the content and successfully demonstrate understanding of the learning outcomes. Furthermore, expert teachers look beyond the school for resources to bring their subjects to life and to assist students who need help in both their academic and nonacademic lives.				
1D - Demonstrating Knowledge of Resources <ul style="list-style-type: none">Resources for Classroom UseResources to Extend Content Knowledge and PedagogyResources for Students	Ineffective <ul style="list-style-type: none">Teacher is unaware of school or district resources for classroom use, for the expansion of his or her own knowledge, or for students.	Developing <ul style="list-style-type: none">Teacher displays basic awareness of school or district resources available for classroom use, for the expansion of his or her own knowledge, and for students, but no knowledge of resources available more broadly.	Accomplished <ul style="list-style-type: none">Teacher displays awareness of resources – not only through the school and district but also through sources external to the school and on the Internet – available for classroom use, for the expansion of his or her own knowledge, and for students.	Exemplary <ul style="list-style-type: none">Teacher displays extensive knowledge of resources – not only through the school and district but also in the community, through professional organizations and universities, and on the Internet—for classroom use, for the expansion of his or her own knowledge, and for students.
	Critical Attributes <ul style="list-style-type: none">The teacher uses only district-provided materials, even when more variety would assist some students.The teacher does not seek out resources available to expand his or her own skill. Although aware of some student needs, the teacher does not inquire about possible resources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">The teacher uses materials in the school library but does not search beyond the school for resources.The teacher participates in content-area workshops offered by the school but does not pursue other professional development.The teacher locates materials and resources for students that are available through the school but does not pursue any other avenues.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Texts are at varied levels.Texts are supplemented by guest speakers and field experiences.Teacher facilitates Internet resources.Resources are multidisciplinary.Teacher expands knowledge with professional learning groups and organizations.Teacher pursues options offered by universities.Teacher provides lists of resources outside the class for students to draw on.	In addition to the characteristics of "accomplished": <ul style="list-style-type: none">Texts are matched to student skill level.The teacher has ongoing relationship with colleges and universities that support student learning.The teacher maintains log of resources for student reference.The teacher pursues apprenticeships to increase discipline knowledge.The teacher facilitates student contact with resources outside the classroom.
Possible Examples <ul style="list-style-type: none">For their unit on China, the students acquired all of their information from the district-supplied textbook.Mr. J is not sure how to teach fractions but doesn't know how he's expected to learn it by himself.A student says, "It's too bad we can't go to the nature center when we're doing our unit on environment."	<ul style="list-style-type: none">For a unit on ocean life, the teacher really needs more books, but the school library has only three for him to borrow.The teacher knows she should learn more about teaching literacy, but the school offered only one professional development day last year.The teacher thinks his students would benefit from hearing about health safety from a professional; he contacts the school nurse to visit his classroom.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">The teacher provides her 5th graders a range of nonfiction texts about the American Revolution; no matter their reading level, all students can participate in the discussion of important concepts.The teacher took an online course on literature to expand her knowledge of great American writers.The teacher distributes a list of summer reading materials that would help prepare his 8th graders' transition to high school.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">The teacher is not happy with the out-of-date textbook; his students will critique it and write their own text for social studies.The teacher spends the summer at Dow Chemical learning about current research so that she can expand her knowledge base for teaching chemistry.The teacher matches students in her Family and Consumer Science class with local businesses; the students spend time shadowing employees to understand how their classroom skills might be used on the job.	